



# PUBLIC POLICY JOURNAL

## EFFECTIVENESS OF WASTE MANAGEMENT WITH THE METHOD OF WASTE MANAGEMENT PLACE REDUCE, REUSE, RECYCLE

Sukmawan Soga<sup>1</sup>, Juriko Abdussamad<sup>2</sup>, Fenti Prihatini D. Tui<sup>3</sup>

<sup>1,2,3</sup>Administrasi Publik, Fakultas Ilmu Sosial, Universitas Negeri Gorontalo Email:  
[sogasukmawan29@gmail.com](mailto:sogasukmawan29@gmail.com)<sup>1</sup>, [jurikoabdussamad@yahoo.co.id](mailto:jurikoabdussamad@yahoo.co.id)<sup>2</sup>,  
[fentiprihatini@ung.ac.id](mailto:fentiprihatini@ung.ac.id)<sup>3</sup>

### Abstract

*This study aims to determine how effective waste management is based on the 3R Waste Management Site in Bone Bolango Regency. This study used a qualitative descriptive approach method, while the data collection techniques used were observation, interviews, and documentation. Based on the results of the study, it is known that the effectiveness of waste management based on the 3R Waste Management Site in Bone Bolango Regency includes, program success, target success, satisfaction with the program, suitability of inputs and outputs, overall goal achievement has gone quite well, but has not been effective. This was influenced by several obstacles such as problems procuring funds for operational costs, limited knowledge of human resources, and lack of attention and supervision from the government on 3R Waste Management Sites, causing several 3R Waste Management Sites to stop operating. Factors that determine the success of waste management based on the 3R Waste Management Site in Bone Bolango Regency include organizational characteristics, environmental characteristics, worker characteristics, and management practices. Overall, these factors have been carried out well, it can be seen from the existence of administrators or managers who run the 3R Waste Management Site, adequate internal and external environments, managers who are skilled and responsible in carrying out their duties, and the active role of the chairman in mobilizing their members.*

**Keywords:** Effectiveness, Waste Management, 3R Waste Management site (TPS)

### INTRODUCTION

Waste is a problem that exists in every country, so the waste problem is a national problem that must be solved. Based on these conditions, the government is involved in drafting regulations on good and correct waste management and supporting them by providing facilities to overcome waste problems in Indonesian society. According to Law Number 18 of 2008 concerning Waste Management, waste is defined as the rest of human daily activities or natural processes in solid or semi-solid form in the form of organic substances or inorganic substances that are decomposable or non-biodegradable which are considered useless and disposed of into the environment. As Indonesia's population increases, this has led to an increase in the amount of garbage accumulation, which shows that the waste problem has not been solved optimally.

The main reason why optimal waste management is difficult to achieve is that many people or communities think that waste management can only be done by collecting and then transporting and then disposing of it at the Landfill (TPA). This kind of community mindset is very unfortunate because if you only rely on landfills, it cannot ultimately reduce the amount of waste accumulation generated from community activities. In this case, the landfill accommodates a heavy load, so the action that must be taken is to reduce waste from the source significantly. According to Law No. 18 of 2008 concerning Waste Management, it is explained that the community is expected to participate in the management of household waste and similar types of household waste both in terms of reduction which includes restriction, reuse, and recycling activities, as well as waste handling including, collection, cultivation, processing and final composting. The management system by Law No. 18 of 2008 is waste management using the 3R TPS principle. The 3R principle is the waste management concept of Reducing, Reusing, and Recycling waste from the source.

The implementation of the Reduce-Reuse-Recycle (TPS 3R) Waste Treatment Plant is a pattern of waste management approach on a communal or regional scale, involving the active role of the government and the community, through a community empowerment approach, including for low-income people and/or those living in dense and slum settlements. (Director General of Cipta Karya, 2017). Bone Bolango Regency is one of the regencies in Gorontalo Province. Regionally, Bone Bolango Regency is an area that is still developing as well as its people. Bone Bolango Regency produces a volume of waste reaching 2,000 tons per year (DLH Bone Bolango Regency 2020). In the field of waste, Bone Bolango Regency has carried out development in community-based waste management as a form of community concern for the environment.

The TPS 3R principle involves the community and the government, where the community plays a major role in running and managing, while the government plays a role in providing support and facilities as support in the management process. The purpose of the construction of TPS 3R is to increase the commitment of local governments to the implementation of TPS 3R and reduce the burden of waste disposal at the landfill by reducing waste generation at the source. Waste management by the principles of TPS 3R is a form of government and community effort in participating in reducing the amount of waste generation. Waste is a source of disease besides that waste can pollute the environment. The application of the 3R system in the waste management process will reduce the amount of waste generation. Reducing the amount of waste generation will have a good impact on the environment to

minimize the threat of health problems to the community. Waste generation that is managed properly will help improve the quality of environmental hygiene, with the reduction of excessive waste will make people feel comfortable in the environment.

**Table 1.1**  
**Data on the construction of 3R polling stations in Bone Bolango Regency**

No	Name TPS 3R	Location	Year Established
1	KSM Cemerlang	Ayula Selatan	2016
2	KSM Sehat Sejahtera	Dutohe Barat	2017
3	KSM Terbit	Boidu	2020
4	KSM Cahaya	Ulantha	2021

Data Source: EIK Field, Bappeda R&D Bone Bolango Regency 2023

By looking at the table above, the construction of TPS 3R in Bone Bolango Regency always increases from year to year. Since the first construction of TPS 3R in Bone Bolango Regency, namely in 2016 until now, the number of 3R TPS in Bone Bolango Regency there are 4 TPS 3R, namely KSM Cemerlang located in South Ayula Village, South Bulango District, KSM Sehat Sejahtera in West Dutohe Village, Kabila District, KSM Terbit Boidu Village, North Bulango District, and KSM Cahaya in Ulantha Village, Suwawa District. The increasing construction of TPS 3R in Bone Bolango Regency is a hope that the problem of waste can be resolved, but until now the problems caused by waste have not been resolved.

Based on the results of initial observations made, shows that the problems seen by researchers regarding waste in each 3R TPS location in Bone Bolango Regency tend to be the same, this can be seen from the still-existing garbage piled up in several 3R TPS that have not been sorted by type, this condition shows that in terms of aspects of program success, it can be said that it has not been fully successful. Another most complex problem is that the activities at TPS 3R do not run routinely as the purpose of the construction of TPS 3R itself, this shows that in terms of aspects of success, the target has not reached the target as expected. The problems found above are caused by the ineffectiveness of activities carried out at TPS 3R.

Waste management at TPS 3R plays an important role for the local government of Bone Bolango Regency in fostering public concern for the importance of managing waste well so that it also has a good impact on the environment and the community. Based on the description of the problem, researchers are interested in conducting a study entitled "The Effectiveness of TPS 3R-Based Waste Management in Bone Bolango Regency".

**METHODS**

The type of research that will be used in this study is qualitative research. According to Walidin et al., ((Fadli, 2021) qualitative research is a research process to understand human or social phenomena by creating a comprehensive and complex picture that can be presented in words, reporting detailed views obtained from informant sources, and carried out in a natural setting. This study will collect and interpret data obtained from valid sources to discuss the Effectiveness of TPS 3R-Based Waste Management in Bone Bolango District.

The source of data to be used in this study is qualitative data. Lofland ((Maleong, 2013) the main data sources in qualitative research are words and actions, the rest are additional data such as documents and others. Data sources will be taken from observations, field notes, interviews, and documents. The data used in this study used boxes of data source types, namely primary data and secondary data. The primary data to be used in this study is data obtained from observations and interviews related to the Effectiveness of TPS 3R-Based Waste Management in Bone Bolango Regency. Secondary data This study which is the source of secondary data is the law on waste management, books, journals, and articles related to the title of the study, namely the Effectiveness of TPS 3R-Based Waste Management in Bone Bolango Regency.

Data collection techniques in this study are observation, interviews, and documentation. The observation in this study is to make direct observations in the field to find out the waste management process at TPS 3R in Bone Bolango Regency. The interview to be used in this study is a free guided interview. According to Arikunto (in (Claretta & Rachmawati, 2022), a free guided interview is an interview conducted by asking questions freely but still within the interview guidelines that have been made. The purpose of this interview is to obtain relevant information related to the Effectiveness of TPS 3R-Based Waste Management in Bone Bolango Regency. Sugiyono (in Haeruddin, et, al 2022) stated that documentation is the use of archival studies and observational studies to provide data in the form of books, archives, documents, written figures, and photos in the form of reports and information that can support research. The documentation used in this study is a document obtained from the Environmental Office in Bone Bolango Regency which relates to TPS 3R-based waste management in Bone Bolango Regency.

Miles & and Huberman (in Nasir Harpindo, Nurhayati, 2023) stated that there are three types of activities or patterns in data analysis, namely data reduction, data presentation, and conclusion. Sugiyono (in (Nasir Harpindo, Nurhayati, 2023) stated that data reduction is to

summarize the main things, focus on important things, and look for patterns and themes that

are by the research topic, to provide a clearer picture to make it easier for the dam to collect the next data. Sugiyono (in (Nasir Harpindo, Nurhayati, 2023) stated that after reducing the data, the next step is to present the data. In qualitative research, the presentation of data can be done in the form of tables, graphs, flowcharts, pictograms, and the like. Through the submission of these data, the data can be organized and arranged so that it will be easier to understand. Sugiyono (in (Nasir Harpindo, Nurhayati, 2023) stated that the last step in qualitative data analysis is concluding. Conclusions in qualitative research can answer problem formulations that have been formulated from the beginning, but may not be, because as has been stated problems and problem formulations in qualitative research are still temporary and will develop after the research is in the field.

## **RESULTS AND DISCUSSION**

### **A. Effectiveness of 3R TPS-Based Waste Management in Bone Bolango District**

The regulation of the Regent of Bone Bolango Regency Number 1 of 2015 concerning Waste Management, is held based on the principle of responsibility, the principle of sustainability, the principle of benefits, and the principle of economic value. This study discusses the effectiveness of waste management with the 3R TPS principle, therefore Researchers use effectiveness theory according to Campbell in measuring the effectiveness of 3R TPS-based waste management which can be measured based on program success, target success, satisfaction with the program, suitability of inputs and outputs and achievement of overall goals. The success of the program in question is a goal that will be achieved towards the program which involves the role of the community and also the district government, in this case DLH as a facilitator. Furthermore, the success of the target means how far the level of goals in the program or policy of the government to achieve the goals that have been set. Then satisfaction with the program means something that can be felt by the community or recipients of the program, then the suitability of inputs and outputs if the inputs produced are greater than the outputs it means a program is inefficient, otherwise if the output is greater than the inputs means the program is running effectively. Then the achievement of the overall goal is a general assessment of the extent to which the organization or manager performs tasks to achieve the goals that have been set. So this research was conducted to see how effective waste management based on TPS 3R in Bone Bolango Regency.

Based on the results of research on the focus and subfocus of this study, it is known that the effectiveness of waste management based on the 3R Waste Management Site (TPS) as a whole has been running quite well, but has not been effective. This was influenced by several

obstacles such as problems in procuring funds for operational costs, limited knowledge of human resources, and lack of attention and supervision from the government on 3R Waste Management Sites (TPS), causing several 3R Waste Management Sites to stop operating. For this reason, the results of the study are discussed through the following description:

### **1. Program Success**

Success is an achievement that has been intended to be achieved or the ability to overcome or overcome a failure so as not to be revisited. Based on the theory expressed by Campbell in (Mamonto et al., 2018) program success is a measurement of effectiveness in the sense that it has achieved a predetermined goal. In measuring the success of the program, it can be seen based on the suitability of the infrastructure that has been determined and the suitability of the factors involved in it.

Based on the results of interviews and research data obtained by researchers related to the success of the 3R TPS-based waste management program in Bone Bolango Regency, it shows that, in general, the success of the 3R TPS program has not been fully successful, this is evidenced by the results of interviews and direct observations in the field that researchers conducted with informants, it was found that from four numbers of 3R TPS In Bone Bolango district, there is only one 3R polling station operating, namely TPS 3R KSM Cemerlang Ayula Selatan. This is due to the problem of insufficient operational costs in accommodating the needs of TPS 3R, so that a total of 3 TPS 3R have stopped operating, namely TPS 3R KSM Terbit Boidu, TPS 3R KSM Sehat Sejahtera Dutohe Barat and TPS 3R Ulantha which has only been running for 10 months since its construction in 2021. Based on the TPS 3R Technical Guidelines, the buildings or infrastructure provided are by the standard provisions for TPS 3R building construction planning. However, this does not guarantee the sustainability of waste management at TPS because it is constrained by operational costs. For this reason, there needs to be attention from the local government in terms of improvement by making improvements to the 3R TPS-based waste management process in Bone Bolango Regency by paying attention to and guaranteeing the budget for the sustainability of the 3R TPS and the welfare of workers or managers of the 3R TPS.

### **2. Goal Success**

According to Campbell (Memento et al., 2018), the success of goals is a measurement of effectiveness in terms of achieving goals, where the success of an organization must consider not only organizational goals but also the mechanism of maintaining goals. The success of the target can be interpreted as a form of strategy or a way taken to achieve a predetermined goal,

if the strategy used is right then the target targeted at the program can be said to be appropriate as well.

Based on the results of research obtained by researchers in the field related to data on the success of the program in waste management based on TPS 3R in Bone Bolango Regency, in general, it can be said to be right on target where the building or TPS 3R building has been used by the purpose of its construction. In the process of TPS-based waste management 3R has been carried out by SOP (Standard Operating Procedure) where the stages of waste management begin with the collection of waste from house to house, then transported to the TPS, in the TPS sorting is carried out based on the type of waste, then waste processing is carried out with the 3R principle, the final stage of the process is to dispose of waste that cannot be processed into the Talumelito landfill. The above findings were obtained from interviews with the management of TPS 3R and also from direct observations made by researchers in the field.

### **3. Program Satisfaction**

According to Campbell (Mamonto et al., 2018) satisfaction with the program is an effectiveness criterion that refers to the success of a program in meeting the needs of the recipients of the program. Satisfaction can be felt by people or program recipients on the quality of the program received. The more quality a program provides, the higher the satisfaction that can be felt by program recipients. This will cause a good assessment for the program maker in this case the government and also the implementer or manager.

Based on the results of the research conducted, researchers saw that the 3R TPS-based waste management program had a fairly good impact. This is evidenced by interviews conducted by researchers with managers and communities as implementers and also those who benefit from the existence of this 3R TPS. Regarding satisfaction with community programs, especially as program recipients, they are very satisfied with the existence of TPS 3R. They are greatly helped by the presence of TPS 3R, and problems related to waste can be resolved, which used to be They admitted that they often litter, throw garbage into rivers, and often burn garbage, with the presence of TPS 3R, this behavior is no longer carried out. So the existence of TPS 3R can be one solution in helping reduce the problem of waste scattered in inappropriate places.

### **4. Input and Output Compatibility**

Based on the theory Campbell (Mamonto et al., 2018) explains that effectiveness at the input and output levels can be seen based on a comparison between input or input with





commonly called output. Fitriani & Nurcahyanto (Wati et al., 2021) argue that the input in question can be in the form of capital such as human resources and sources of funds or collateral.

Based on the results of interviews conducted by researchers with informants, it was found that the source of funds in waste management based on TPS 3R was obtained from the results of community contributions that were mutually agreed upon through deliberation with a nominal value of Rp. 10,000 every month which must be paid by customers, in this case, people who subscribe to TPS 3R. People who subscribe to TPS 3R will get services from the TPS manager in the form of transporting waste from residents' homes or the community which is picked up directly by the manager using Viar and a fleet of waste carriers. Then the waste will be delivered to TPS 3R for further processing. The results of processed waste are in physical form in the form of compost which can be used as organic fertilizer.

### **5. Achievement of Overall Goals**

Based on the theory expressed by Campbell in achievement of overall goals is an indicator in measuring effectiveness which means that the effectiveness of an activity or program can be seen from how far the organization carries out its duties in achieving the goals that have been set. In this case, it is seen from various assessments in general with various criteria to produce a general assessment related to organizational effectiveness. The general assessment referred to in the effectiveness indicator of achieving the overall goal is an assessment related to how much benefit is felt by the community with the existence of TPS 3R-based waste management. Whether it has a positive impact or vice versa only has a negative impact.

Based on the results of interviews related to data on the achievement of overall goals conducted by researchers, it is known that the 3R TPS has a positive impact on the community, managers, and the environment. Where the community claims that the existence of a reduce, reuse, and recycle-based Waste Management Site (TPS 3R) is very helpful in reducing and overcoming waste problems in the surrounding environment, thus making the environment clean and free from waste. Then the benefits felt, especially for managers at TPS 3R, are that they can increase the income obtained from the sale of plastic waste such as packaging cups, and plastic bottles, Besides that there are also used cardboard boxes and the like that have value or price. The negative benefits of the 3R TPS are according to community recognition, especially those in South Ayula village, some people whose homes are adjacent to the 3R TPS

feel disturbed by activities inside the 3R TPS, such as noise generated from the waste management process using a shredding machine, then unpleasant odors or smells coming from garbage in the TPS. This recognition was strengthened by observations on July 11, 2023. This could happen because the location of the TPS 3R building is less strategic so it can interfere with the comfort and beauty of the environment.

### **B. Factors that Determine the Success of 3R Waste Management Based Waste Management Site (TPS) in Bone Bolango Regency**

Effectiveness is an act of occurrence of an effect or desired impact that is emphasized on the effect or result for the achievement of goals. Steers (Isa, 2009) states that four factors determine the success of program effectiveness, namely, organizational characteristics, environmental characteristics, worker characteristics, and management practices. In this study, by the findings in the field, especially in Bone Bolango Regency related to waste management based on TPS 3R as a whole, these factors have been carried out well, it can be seen from the existence of administrators who run TPS 3R, adequate internal and external environments, workers and managers who are skilled and responsible in carrying out their duties and the active role of the chairman in moving its members.

In addition, findings from the results of research discussion on related research sub-focuses found that:

#### **1. Organizational Characteristics**

According to Steers (Isa, 2009), organizational characteristics consist of organizational structure and technology. Structure is a way of organization in arranging people or members for the creation of an organization. The organizational structure aims to explain and describe the specialization of work based on the position in which there is interaction and interconnection with one another. Technology is a mechanism in the organization that can convert raw inputs into finished outputs. With the development of information and technology today, it will be easier to understand and accept new things to be applied using the available facilities to influence the effectiveness of the organization. In this study, organizational characteristics are seen based on the organizational structure by job specialization and also technology that supports the success of TPS 3R-based waste management in Bone Bolango Regency.

Based on the results of observations and direct interviews conducted by researchers on July 13, 2023, related to organizational characteristics, it is known that in waste management based on TPS 3R, some managers are responsible and in charge of running TPS 3R which are

formed in one group, hereinafter referred to as the Non-Community Group (KSM) and the Benefit Maintenance Group (KPP). This group was formed through joint deliberation which resulted in the Chairman, Secretary, Treasurer, and Members, then determined by the Decree of the village head related to the establishment of KSM or KPP at each 3R polling station. Furthermore, in supporting and supporting the success of waste management with the 3R TPS principle, of course, accompanied by technology. In this case, the use of technology in question is in the form of tools or infrastructure available in TPS 3R such as waste shredding machines, press machines, sieving machines, and also three-wheeled viar. These tools can help reduce the burden on workers because almost all jobs use technology (machines) to speed up the work process.

## **2. Environmental Characteristics**

According to Steers (Isa, 2009), organizational characteristics are divided into two aspects, namely the internal environment and the external environment. In this case, the internal environment in question is the organizational climate that concerns the work environment which includes all aspects of it. The external environment is a force that appears outside the boundaries of the organization and can affect actions in the organization. In environmental characteristics, it can be interpreted that the success of an organization is largely determined by the ability to respond to the state of its environment. This study is related to environmental characteristics in waste management, it focuses on the state or condition of the internal and external environment of TPS 3R.

Based on the results of direct interviews with informants on July 11-13, 2023, by the observations made by researchers, data related to environmental characteristics are known, namely, in terms of the internal environment, in this case, the environment inside TPS 3R, it was found that the environment around TPS 3R was adequate in terms of infrastructure and facilities. This is evidenced by the establishment of a permanent building of the Waste Management Site which is certainly by building construction standards and the availability of equipment in it that is quite adequate and supportive during the waste management process in TPS 3R as stated in the TPS 3R technical instructions. Then in terms of the external environment, the construction of TPS 3R was built in a location that is a little far away from community settlements, so that the waste management process in TPS 3R does not interfere with the community and the surrounding environment.

### **3. Characteristics of workers**

According to the theory expressed by Steers) related to worker characteristics the role of an individual's behavior in organizational effectiveness must be able to meet three behavioral requirements that are important in ensuring the ultimate success of the organization, including: a) every organization must be able to foster and also maintain a fleet of skilled men and women, b) if an organization wants to operate effectively for each Its members, then, must be willing to work and also carry out specific tasks by the responsibilities that have been given, and c) an effective organization also demands that every employee be able to strive for an innovative form of behavior. Based on this theory, in this study, researchers want to see the characteristics of workers based on the skills they have, then the implementation of duties with full responsibility and innovation from workers, in this case, the managers of TPS 3R.

Based on the results of interviews and observations that occur in the field related to data on worker characteristics, it is known that individual characteristics in an organization, in this case, Non-Community Groups and Maintenance Groups Use TPS 3R-based waste management in terms of skills, researchers see that each worker or manager is skilled in carrying out their duties, this can be seen from the skills of workers in operating Viar tricycle to pick up garbage from house to house, the workers are skilled in sorting waste, the workers can operate the equipment in the 3R TPS. Then in terms of responsibility, it can be seen that every worker or manager has been responsible for carrying out their duties, where they have carried out the function of TPS 3R, starting from waste pick-up, waste sorting, then the waste management process to the final stage has been carried out properly. Furthermore, in terms of innovation, researchers see that workers have not given birth to meaningful innovations in TPS 3R, This is due to the spread of knowledge from workers so in terms of innovation they are only limited to making compost from organic waste used as fertilizer. The results of the above statement are strengthened based on the results of interviews and direct observations of the field conducted by researchers on July 13, 2023, located in all 3R polling stations in Bone Bolango Regency.

### **4. Management Practices**

In management practice, there are several criteria consisting of setting strategic goals, searching and utilizing resources efficiently, then creating an environment of achievement, communication processes, leadership, and library retrieval as well as adaptation and innovation in the organization. In connection with that Mintzberg (Isa, 2009) revealed that there are three main managerial roles, namely a) interpersonal role, b) decision-making role, and c)

information role. In management practice in this study, researchers focus more on how the role of a leader is seen based on his interpersonal role, decision-making making, and his role as an informer to each member of an organization called the Non-Community Group and the 3R TPS-based waste management utilization maintenance group.

Based on the results of observations and interviews conducted by researchers with informants related to management practices in waste management, it was found that a manager or Chairman of TPS 3R interpersonal roles can be seen from the implementation of his function as a leader where a chairman is in charge of monitoring members and is responsible and providing education to members in terms of implementing waste management by 3R principle. then about a manager with his role as a decision maker, in this case, every chairman of KSM and KPP in TPS 3R makes decisions based on mutual deliberation with members related to operations and resources in it. Furthermore, in providing information, a manager or chairman of TPS 3R has the right to notify its members related to information in the form of socialization or visits from the Environmental Agency as the body that oversees their organization. The provision of information by the manager or chairman to the members is conveyed directly and also indirectly through social media in the form of WhatsApp connected through one group. The results of the above statement were obtained by researchers through direct interviews with the leaders of TPS 3R from 11 to 13 July 2023 in Bone Bolango Regency.

## **CONCLUSION**

The effectiveness of TPS 3R-based waste management in Bone Bolango District can be seen from several indicators, namely program success, target success, satisfaction with the program, suitability of inputs and outputs and achievement of overall goals have been running quite well, but have not been effective. This was influenced by several obstacles such as problems procuring funds for operational costs, limited knowledge of human resources, and lack of attention and supervision from the government on TPS 3R, causing some TPS 3R to stop operating.

1. Factors that determine the success of TPS 3R-based waste management in Bone Bolango District, which include: organizational characteristics, environmental characteristics, worker characteristics, and management practices. Based on the results of the overall research, these factors have been carried out well, it can be seen from the existence of administrators who run TPS 3R, adequate internal and external environments, workers and managers who are skilled and responsible in carrying out their duties and the active role of the chairman in mobilizing their members.

**REFERENCES**

- Abdussamad, J., Tui, F. P., Mohamad, F., & Dunggio, S. (2022). Implementasi Kebijakan Pengelolaan Sampah Melalui Program Bank Sampah Di Dinas Lingkungan Hidup Kabupaten Bone Bolango. *Publik: Jurnal Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia, Administrasi dan Pelayanan Publik*, 9(4), 850-868.
- Agustino, L. (2008). *Dasar-dasar Kebijakan Publik*. Bandung: Alfabeta.
- Bolango, B. B., Bolango, B. B., Bone, K., & Bolango, B. (2013). *Bupati bone bolango*.
- Claretta, D., & Rachmawati, F. (2022). Inovasi Dan Strategi Public Relations Dalam Meningkatkan Citra Perusahaan. *CV. Literasi Nusantara Abadi*, 2(3), 83–103.
- Fadli, M. R. (2021). Memahami desain metode penelitian kualitatif. *Humanika*, 21(1), 33–54.
- Isa, R. (2009). Efektivitas Organisasi Kecamatan Dalam Pelayanan Publik Setelah Menjadi Perangkat Daerah. *Inovasi*, 6(4), 70–86.
- Maleong, J. (2013). *Lexy, Metode Penelitian Kualitatif*, Bandung: PT. Remaja Rosda Karya.
- mamonto et al., 2018. (2018). Efektivitas Kinalang Sebagai Aplikasi Pelayanan Publik Berbasis Elektronik Di Kota Kotamobagu. <https://Medium.Com/>, 2(1), 1–14.
- Nasir Harpindo, Nurhayati, S. E. (2023). Usaha Mikro Kecil Menengah (UMKM) adalah kegiatan ekonomi yang dilakukan oleh sebagian besar masyarakat Indonesia sebagai tumpuan dalam memperoleh pendapatan. *Data Kementerian Koperasi dan Usaha Kecil dan Menengah (2015)* menyatakan bahwa persentase U. 2(1), 102–119.
- Wati, F. R., Rizqi, A., M. Iqbal, M. I., Langi, S. S., & Putri, D. N. (2021). Efektivitas Kebijakan Pengelolaan Sampah Berbasis Tempat Pengelolaan Sampah Terpadu 3R di Indonesia. *Perspektif*, 10(1), 195–203